Beth S. Ginsberg, OSB #070890 beth.ginsberg@stoel.com Jason T. Morgan, WSBA #38346 (*Pro Hac Vice*) jason.morgan@stoel.com STOEL RIVES LLP 600 University Street, Suite 3600 Seattle, WA 98101

Telephone: (206) 624-0900 Facsimile: (206) 386-7500

Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant Northwest RiverPartners

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF OREGON

AUDUBON SOCIETY OF PORTLAND, WILDLIFE CENTER OF THE NORTH COAST, ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE FUND, CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY, FRIENDS OF ANIMALS,

Plaintiffs,

v.

U.S. ARMY OF ENGINEERS, U.S. FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE, USDA WILDLIFE SERVICES,

Defendants.

Case No.: 3:15-cv-00665-MO

DECLARATION OF BETH GINSBERG IN SUPPORT OF NORTHWEST RIVERPARTNERS' OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION

- 1. My name is Beth Ginsberg. I am an attorney of record for Northwest RiverPartners ("RiverPartners"). I am fully familiar with and have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this declaration, which I make in support of the RiverPartners' Opposition to
 - Page 1 DECLARATION OF BETH GINSBERG IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION.

Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction. If called to testify, I could and would competently testify to the facts stated in this Declaration.

- 2. Attached to this Declaration are true and correct copies of documents relied upon in RiverPartners' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction.
- 3. Attached as Exhibit A are true and correct copies of documents reporting on the State of Oregon's efforts to obtain a depredation permit from the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.
 - 4. The following documents are included in Exhibit A:
 - a. Two 2011 issues of *Fishworks*, a newsletter published by the Oregon Department of Fish and Wildlife ("ODFW");
 - b. A programmatic overview of ODFW's 2012-13 Avian Predation Program;
 - c. The Summary of Preliminary Juvenile Salmonid Consumption Estimates by Double-crested Cormorants in Tillimook Bay during April and May 2012 (Oregon State University, May 2012);
 - d. An April 27, 2012 newspaper article from The Seattle Times entitled, "Oregon seeks to kill cormorants to protect endangered salmon"; and
 - e. An April 27, 2012 article from the Columbia Basin Bulletin entitled, "Oregon Wants Access to 'Lethal Management Tools' in Reducing Salmon-Eating Cormorant Numbers."
- 5. Attached as Exhibit B is a true and correct copy of select comments submitted on the *Double-crested Cormorant Draft EIS*, which are generally supportive of the management of double-crested cormorant populations, including the use of lethal take.
- 6. Attached as Exhibit C is a true and correct copy of excerpts from the 2014

 Supplemental Biological Opinion, Consultation on Remand for Operation of the Federal

 Columbia River Power System, including an excerpt setting forth the basis for NOAA Fisheries'

¹ Available at http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/fish_passage/fcrps_opinion/federal_columbia_river_power_system.html.

Page 2 - DECLARATION OF BETH GINSBERG IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION.

"survival gap" analysis and Appendix E, Double-Crested Cormorant Estuary Smolt Consumption Bi-Op Analysis.

7. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 6th day of May, 2015 at Portland, Oregon.

Beth Ginsberg

Page 3 - DECLARATION OF BETH GINSBERG IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION.

Case 3:15-cv-00665-SI Document 47 Filed 05/06/15 Page 4 of 4

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on May 6, 2015, I filed a true and correct copy of the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court for the United States District Court – District of Oregon by using the CM/ECF system. Participants in this Case No. 3:13-cv-00655-MO; who are registered CM/ECF users will be served by the CM/ECF system.

/s/ Beth S. Ginsberg

Beth S. Ginsberg, OSB #070890

Page 4 - DECLARATION OF BETH GINSBERG IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION.